

# **FINAL EVALUATION REPORT/NOTIFICATION OF INTENTION TO AWARD**

## **Hiring of Third Party Review Firm for Operational Review of Benazir Taleemi Wazaif**

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP)
2	Method of Procurement:	Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS) under World Bank's Procurement Regulations for IPF Borrowers July 2016, [Revised November 2017 and August 2018] ("WB Procurement Regulations")
3	Title of Procurement:	Hiring of Third Party Review Firm for Operational Review of Benazir Taleemi Wazaif
4	Tender Inquiry No:	1-139/Proc/Opr.Review/T.Wazaif/CCT/2022
5	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS 500915 E
6	Date & Time for EOI Closing:	3 <sup>rd</sup> February 2023 at 1600 hours
7	No of EOIs Received:	Nineteen (19)

Sr. #	Firm Name
1	M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad
2	M/s FINCON Services
3	M/s Himat Consulting Private Limited (HCPL)
4	M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.
5	M/s MM Pakistan, Pvt Ltd.
6	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)
7	M/s Aslam Malik & Co. Chartered Accountants
8	M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited
9	M/s Innovative Development Strategies (Private) Limited
10	M/s UHY Hassan Naem & Co. Chartered Accountants
11	M/s Oxford Policy Management (OPM)
<b><u>Joint Venture</u></b>	
12	M/s Shahid Javid Burki Institute of Public Policy at NetSol (BIPP)- <b>Lead Partner</b>
	M/s Nauman Javed Hassnan Rashid Chartered Accountants (NJHR)- <b>Associated Partner (JV Partner)</b>
<b><u>Joint Venture/Association</u></b>	
13	M/s Tameer-Hayat Community Foundation (THCF) with 29 Associating/Members' Firms
<b><u>Joint Venture</u></b>	
14	M/s PACE Technologies (Pvt) Limited
	M/s Innovision Consultants
<b><u>Joint Venture</u></b>	
15	M/s Rafaqat Babar & Co. Chartered Accountants- <b>Lead Partner</b>
	M/s Human Resource Development Center (HRDC) IM Sciences- <b>JV Partner</b>
<b><u>Joint Venture/Association</u></b>	
16	M/s SKAFS Consultants (Pvt) Limited- <b>Leading Partner</b>
	M/s SUKH (Pvt) Limited - <b>Associating/JV Partner</b>
	M/s SUKH Development Foundation- <b>Associating/JV Partner</b>
<b><u>Joint Venture</u></b>	
17	M/s Rural Empowerment and Institutional Development (REPID)- <b>Leading Partner</b>
	M/s Khuram Welfare Home- <b>JV Partner</b>



		<p><b><u>Joint Venture/Consortium/Sub-Consultant</u></b></p> <p>18 M/s Renda Haroon Zakaria &amp; Company (RHZCO)- <b>Leading Partner</b> M/s InvestConsult - JV/Consortium Partner M/s Aamir Salman Rizwan Chartered Accountants- <b>Sub-consultant association</b></p> <p><b><u>Association/Sub-Consultant</u></b></p> <p>19 M/s Tabadlab (Private) Limited- <b>Leading Partner</b> M/s IPSOS- Sub-consultant</p>												
8	No of EOIs Shortlisted and Issued RFP	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Five (05)</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr. #</th> <th>Firm Name</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1.</td> <td>M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2.</td> <td>M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3.</td> <td>M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4.</td> <td>M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5.</td> <td>M/s Oxford Policy Management (OPM)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sr. #	Firm Name	1.	M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad	2.	M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.	3.	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)	4.	M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited	5.	M/s Oxford Policy Management (OPM)
Sr. #	Firm Name													
1.	M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad													
2.	M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.													
3.	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)													
4.	M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited													
5.	M/s Oxford Policy Management (OPM)													
9	No of Proposals received:	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Four (04)</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr. #</th> <th>Firm Name</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1.</td> <td>M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2.</td> <td>M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3.</td> <td>M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4.</td> <td>M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sr. #	Firm Name	1.	M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad	2.	M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.	3.	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)	4.	M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited		
Sr. #	Firm Name													
1.	M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad													
2.	M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.													
3.	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)													
4.	M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited													
10	Criteria for Evaluation of Technical Proposals:	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr. #</th> <th>Criterion</th> <th>Points</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1.</td> <td>Specific experience i.e. to submit in the technical proposal the documentary evidences of assignments related to Project/Organizational Operational Reviews/Performance Audit preferably in Cash Transfer Programmes successfully conducted by the Consultant in Public/Private sectors that best illustrate the requirements mentioned in the Section-7-TORs.</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2.</td> <td>Adequacy and quality of the proposed Approach &amp; Methodology, sampling techniques, and Work Plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs)</td> <td>50</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sr. #	Criterion	Points	1.	Specific experience i.e. to submit in the technical proposal the documentary evidences of assignments related to Project/Organizational Operational Reviews/Performance Audit preferably in Cash Transfer Programmes successfully conducted by the Consultant in Public/Private sectors that best illustrate the requirements mentioned in the Section-7-TORs.	10	2.	Adequacy and quality of the proposed Approach & Methodology, sampling techniques, and Work Plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs)	50			
Sr. #	Criterion	Points												
1.	Specific experience i.e. to submit in the technical proposal the documentary evidences of assignments related to Project/Organizational Operational Reviews/Performance Audit preferably in Cash Transfer Programmes successfully conducted by the Consultant in Public/Private sectors that best illustrate the requirements mentioned in the Section-7-TORs.	10												
2.	Adequacy and quality of the proposed Approach & Methodology, sampling techniques, and Work Plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs)	50												

	The number of points to be assigned to the following sub-criteria and relevant weights:	
	<b>Technical Approach &amp; Methodology and Sampling Techniques</b>	
2.1	[Notes to the Consultants: <i>The Client will assess whether the proposed technical approach and methodology is clear, responds to and cover the all components requirements, and objectives being elaborated in the TORs, whether the sampling techniques are representative, generalized and is appropriate to achieve the desire objectives and outputs or otherwise</i> ]	35
	<b>Work Plan</b>	
2.2	[It will be assessed that work plan is responding to the given timelines of the client, realistic, implementable and covering all the aspects/components of the assignment]	10
	<b>Organization and Staffing</b>	
2.3	[It will be assessed that overall team composition is balanced i.e. Key Experts & Non-Key Experts and has an appropriate skills mix, and the work plan has right input of Experts]	5
3.	<b>Key Experts' qualifications and competency for the Assignment:</b>	<b>40</b>
	{Notes to Consultant: each position number corresponds to the same for the Key Experts in Form TECH-6 to be prepared by the Consultant}.	
	The number of points to be assigned to each of the below positions or disciplines shall be determined considering the following sub criteria and relevant percentage weights:	
(a)	General qualifications (general education, training, and experience):	10%
(b)	Adequacy for the Assignment (relevant education, training, experience in the sector/similar assignments):	80%
(c)	Relevant experience in the region (local culture/gender sensitive/difficult to reach locations or administrative system, government organization, has performed relevant/specific tasks and assignments etc).	10%
	<b>Total Weight</b>	<b>100%</b>
	<b><u>Team Leader:</u></b>	
3.1	Ph.D. (preferably) or university degree (16 years of education) in economics or development studies or social sciences, with 10 years of M&E related experience (planning, supervision, and execution). S/he shall possess experience of leading surveys and analyzing data using mixed methods.	10
	<b><u>Monitoring and Evaluation Expert:</u></b>	
3.2	University degree (16 years of education) in economics or development studies or social sciences. S/he should have minimum 10 years of demonstrated experience in M&E with reference to surveys and implementation of social safety nets.	7.5
	<b><u>Statistician/Data Analysis Specialist:</u></b>	
		7.5

3.3	At least 5 years of experience in sampling techniques, data processing and analysis. S/he should have university degree (16 years of education), in statistics or a related field and be fully proficient with STATA/SPSS.	
3.4	<b><i>MIS/IT Expert:</i></b> University degree (16 years of education) in IT or related field. S/he should have at least 5 years of experience in designing customized software applications for the surveys including creation of dashboards and web-based solution. S/he should have complete command on the use of Android application for creating survey tools and other customized solutions.	7.5
3.5	<b><i>Operations/Logistics Management Expert</i></b> University degree (16 years of education) in Business Administration. S/he should have at least 5 years of experience in managing operations related to large scale surveys.	7.5
<b>Total Points =</b>		<b>100</b>

11 No of Technical Proposals Technically Qualified:

**Three (03)**

Sr. #	Firm Name	Marks obtained out of total 100
1.	M/s Associates in Development (Pvt.) Ltd., Islamabad	79.38
2.	M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd.	*61.90
3.	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY)	72.83
4.	M/s GAT Consulting (Pvt) Limited	75.10

\*The minimum technical score (St) required to pass is: 70%

12 Conclusions and Recommendations

In view of above, Procurement Evaluation Committee (PEC) recommended the three firms i.e. M/s Associates in Development Pvt. Limited, M/s GAT Consulting Private Limited and M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants (EY) as technically qualified for next stage of the procurement process i.e. to open their financial proposals and to return the financial proposal of technically disqualified Firm i.e. M/s International Consulting Associates (Pvt) Ltd. being un-opened & sealed.

13 **Financial & Combined Evaluation and Scores as per QCBS:**

**a) Financial Evaluation and Scores**

QCBS - Adjustments - Currency Conversion - Evaluated Prices - Financial Scores						
Firm's Name	Proposal's Prices – Excl. of GST		Adjustments	Evaluated Price(s) Excl. of GST	Conversion to currency of evaluation	Financial Scores
	Currency	Amounts				

		[1]	[2]	[3] = [1] + [2]	[4]	[5] = [3] [4]	[6]
M/s Associates in Development (AiD) Private Limited;	Pak Rs.	292,595,839	--	292,595,839	--	--	35.10
M/s GAT Consulting Private Limited;	Pak Rs.	102,700,000	--	102,700,000	--	--	100.00
M/s EY Ford Rhodes, Chartered Accountants	Pak Rs.	106,482,000	--	106,482,000	--	--	96.45

Sf = 100 x Fm/ F, in which "SF" is the financial score, "Fm" is the lowest price, and "F" the price of the proposal under consideration

**b) Combined Evaluation – Award Recommendation:**

Combined Technical/Financial Evaluation - Award Recommendations							
Consultant's Name	Technical Evaluation			Financial Evaluation		Combined Evaluation	
	Technical Scores	Weighted Scores	Technical Rank	Financial Scores	Weighted Scores	Scores	Rank
	S(t)	[S(t) x T]		S(f)	[S(f) x F]	[S(t)xT + S(f)xF]	
M/s Associates in Development (AiD) Private Limited;	79.38	63.50	1	35.10	7.02	70.52	3
M/s GAT Consulting Private Limited;	75.1	60.08	2	100.00	20.00	80.08	1
M/s EY Ford Rhodes, Chartered Accountants	72.83	58.26	3	96.45	19.29	77.55	2
<b>Award Recommendations</b>	To highest combined technical & financial score						
	<b>Firm's Name:</b>		Based on combined evaluation ranking, and subsequent Contract Negotiation Meeting with M/s GAT Consulting Pvt. Ltd. as per the provision of SRFP, M/s GAT Consulting Pvt. Ltd is recommended for award of contract being the highest ranked Firm.				
<b>T (Technical) =</b>		<b>80%</b>	<b>F (Financial) =</b>		<b>20%</b>		

Name: *M. Ibrahim-ul-Haq Awami*

Signature: *[Signature]*  
Deputy Director (Procurement)  
Benazir Income Support Programme  
Government of Pakistan  
Islamabad

Official Stamp: \_\_\_\_\_  
Islamabad

**Distribution:**

1. **Mr. Ijaz Hussain Rizvi**  
Director Operations & Business Development,  
M/s. Associate in development Private Limited  
Plot # 22, Commercial Area, Sector: E-11/2, SCHS E 11/3  
E-11, Islamabad, Islamabad Capital Territory  
Ph: Tel: +92512304979, Email: [ijaz@aidglobal.net](mailto:ijaz@aidglobal.net)

3. **Mr. Saba Ahsan Ali**  
M/s. Gat Consulting Private Limited  
3-Shahrah-e-Aiwan-e-Tijarat, China Chowk, Lahore  
Ph:+92-42-37500724  
Email:[saba@gatconsulting.org](mailto:saba@gatconsulting.org), [contact@gatconsulting.org](mailto:contact@gatconsulting.org)

2. **Mr. Kashif Maqbool Sehga**  
M/s. International Consulting Associates Private Limited  
3rd floor, Zaad Horse, 1 Abdara Road, University Town,  
Peshawar, Pakistan  
Tel: +92 91 570 1657-58, Cell: +92 321 9042525  
Email: [ksehgal@iconsult.com.pk](mailto:ksehgal@iconsult.com.pk)

4. **Mr. Abbas Ali**  
M/s. EY FORD RHODES  
Eagle Plaza, 75-West, Blue Area, Fazlul-Haq Road,  
Islamabad 44000, Ph:+92512344160-62  
Email: [eyfrsh.isb@pk.ey.com](mailto:eyfrsh.isb@pk.ey.com), [abbas.ali@pk.ey.com](mailto:abbas.ali@pk.ey.com)